

**SMP2 Meeting of Client Steering Group (11)**  
**At Upton House**  
**Monday 15<sup>th</sup> September 2008, 0915**

Prior to meeting:

**Monday 8<sup>th</sup> September 2008**

1200: last delivery date for tenders

1400: BBC opens Tenders (envelope 1 only; envelope 2 remains sealed)

1430: DH to make 6 copies of Tender Document & supporting documents

**Tuesday 9<sup>th</sup> September**

DH to deliver copies to voting members of CSG; i.e. PDC, BoP, CBC, NFDC, EA

**Agenda & Timetable for Monday 15<sup>th</sup> September 2008**

- 0915            CSG to arrive at Upton House - coffee
- 0945-1000    Consultant #1 - set up  
1000-1015    Consultant #1 - 15 minute presentation  
1015-1030    Questions & Answers  
1030-1045    CSG mark presentation
- 1045-1100    Consultant #2 - set up  
1100-1115    Consultant #2 - 15 minute presentation  
1115-1130    Questions & Answers  
1130-1145    CSG mark presentation
- 1145-1200    Consultant #3 - set up  
1200-1215    Consultant #3 - 15 minute presentation  
1215-1230    Questions & Answers  
1230-1245    CSG mark presentation
- 1245    Lunch
- 1400    Collate CSG's Quality Marks.
- 1500    Open priced Activity Schedule envelopes (Geoff Turnbull to keep secure)  
          Collate combined quality scores  
          Determine "economically most advantageous tender"
- 1600    Finish

**MINUTES OF DURLSTON HEAD TO HURST SPIT SMP2  
CLIENT STEERING GROUP MEETING #11  
UPTON HOUSE - THURSDAY 25TH SEPTEMBER 2008**

**Present: (\* = Voting member of CSG)**

Geoff Turnbull (GT)	Bournemouth Borough Council (Chair)
Steve Cook* (SC)	New Forest District Council*
David Harlow* (DH)	Bournemouth Borough Council*
Neil Watson* (NW)	Environment Agency (South West)*
Steve Woolard* (SW)	Christchurch Borough Council*
Sarah Austin* (SA)	Borough of Poole*
Mike Goater* (MG)	Purbeck District Council*
Tony Flux (TF)	National Trust
Andrew Bradbury (AB)	New Forest District Council
Peter Ferguson (PF)	New Forest District Council
Richard Caldow (RC)	Natural England
Andrew Ramsbottom (AR)	Poole Harbour Commissioners
Emma Heliker (EH)	Environment Agency (South West)

**Apologies:**

Rachael Gallagher (RG)	Hampshire County Council
Ian Tripp (IT)	Environment Agency (Southern)
David Robson (DR)	Borough of Poole
Richard Edmonds (RE)	Dorset County Council

Item No.		Action
1	<b>Minutes of Last Meeting on 21<sup>st</sup> July 2008</b>	
1.1	The minutes of the last meeting were not discussed.	DH
2	<b>Tender Quality Evaluation</b>	
2.1	GT had received all 6 score sheets by noon on 24 <sup>th</sup> September and reviewed the scores cast. One member had voted consistently high, and one had voted consistently low. GT carried out a "what if" scenario to remove the outliers, but it made very little difference to the outcome. It was agreed to accept the scores as cast, without moderation.	
3	<b>Halcrow Presentation</b>	
3.1	Peter Barter and Dr Helen Jay made a 15-minute presentation, and then answered questions for a further 15 minutes. The CSG voting members recorded scores on the Presentation Evaluation sheet provided.	
4	<b>Mouchel presentation</b>	
4.1	Zoë Hutchinson and Abby Pulham Jay made a 15-minute presentation, and then answered questions for a further 15 minutes. The CSG voting members recorded scores on the Presentation Evaluation sheet provided.	
5	<b>Royal Haskoning Presentation</b>	
5.1	Greg Guthrie and Justin Ridgewell made a 15-minute presentation, and then answered questions for a further 15 minutes. The CSG voting members recorded scores on the	

	Presentation Evaluation sheet provided.	
<b>6</b>	<b>Discussion</b>	
6.1	The CSG voting members passed their Presentation Evaluation sheets to GT and the meeting broke for lunch.	
6.2	After lunch, GT transferred the scores to a spreadsheet and displayed the results. The CSG discussed the results, and noted that all members ranked the three consultants in the same order. It was agreed to accept the scores as cast, without moderation.	
6.3	Stuart Figini (BBC) and Steve Cottrell (BBC) arrived with the unopened Envelopes #2 containing the Priced Activity Schedule, which were then opened and recorded in accordance with BBC procedures.	
6.4	The amounts were entered in the spreadsheet, which calculated the overall score. Royal Haskoning's Tender emerged as the overall winner.	
6.5	Royal Haskoning's Tender was examined for qualifications, and it was determined that their comments about Parent Company Guarantee and FOI Act needed further consideration.	GT
6.6	The three tenders were entered in a spreadsheet, and rates for various items were compared and discussed.	
6.7	RC noted that the principal areas in which Royal Haskoning's bid was low related to areas of considerable interest to Natural England, namely the Strategic Environmental Assessment and Appropriate Assessment.	
6.8	It was noted that Halcrow's tender was not made on the form provided, and might not be acceptable because of that. In addition, several new items had been introduced.	
6.9	It was agreed that the tender of Royal Haskoning should be accepted, subject to final checks.	
6.10	SC indicated that there was a 10-day cooling off period before the result could be announced.	
<b>7</b>	<b>Any Other Business</b>	NFDC BoP
7.1	DH requested that NFDC and BoP invoice BBC by the end of September for work carried out to date.	DH
7.2	RC asked for a copy of Royal Haskoning's Tender. DH undertook to check if the other non-voting members also required copies.	
7.3	The meeting closed at 1600	DH
<b>8</b>	<b>Date of Next Meeting</b>	
8.1	Date and venue to be agreed.	
<b>9</b>	<b>Post - meeting Note</b>	
9.1	A check with BBC Financial Services has confirmed that a Parent Company Guarantee is not required for Royal Haskoning.	

